



The Report Pilot Panel Sitting – 7th March 2018 Clydebank Health and Care Centre

Status of Proposal: Pre-application

Developer: NHS

Introduced by: Pamela Clifford – Planning and Building Standards Manager

Presented by: Jonathan McQuillan – Architect – Anderson Bell Christie

Site information: The Health and Care Centre (H&CC) is to be located on Queen's Quay in Clydebank; the historically significant site of the former John Browns Shipyard where world renowned ships such as HMS Hood, RMS Queen Mary and the QE2 were built.

Much of the urban fabric in Clydebank was destroyed in the 2nd World War during the WW2 Blitz campaign by the German Luftwaffe. Later, with the collapse of the shipping industry on the Clyde, vast areas of waterfront land of extraordinary importance, at John Brown's Shipyard (Queen's Quay) was left vacant. This provides us today with a rich, unique historical and geographical context with exceptional opportunities to regenerate with development solutions that respond to these assets.

The Titan Crane which is a grade A listed structure was a key instrument in the extensive ship building history of Queen's Quay and remains on the site as a proud and prominent feature at the gateway to the basin.

Queens Quay is the subject of an approved masterplan that

accommodates a 'Health Quarter', commercial, leisure and retail opportunities and mixed tenure housing. There are already some significant buildings on the site including the new Clydebank Leisure Centre, West College Scotland, Aurora House and the Titan Enterprise Centre and these will integrate into the wider site development in time.

The H&CC will sit in the context of the 'zone' designated as the 'Health Quarter' at the head of the basin and in one of the most important locations on the site.

The H&CC will be one of the first buildings to be delivered on the site.

It is the ambition of West Dunbartonshire Council that the development on this flagship site contributes to creating an outstanding place, a destination neighbourhood; that it assists with delivering improvements in health and well being of the existing population, to grow the population, increase economic vitality and improve the economic perceptions and future of West Dunbartonshire.



The Report
Pilot Panel Sitting – 7th March 2018
Clydebank Health and Care Centre



Proposals: Jonathan McQuillan of Anderson Bell Christie gave a well presented, comprehensive account of the background research conducted in advance of developing the proposals for the H&CC. This included historical studies of the site, work with artists to gather local knowledge and opinions; and design strategies and precedents employed during the development of the design for the building, material choices and the landscaping strategy employed.

The HCC is set to frame the square at the head of the basin with public space and main public entrance facing onto the public square. On travelling down Titan Boulevard the building steps up in height to lead the eye to feature lantern spaces on the top floor and the focal point on the site – the Titan Crane. There are clear architectural ambitions in terms of the various elements of the proposals; The building model; creating some parity in the importance of and the link between the internal spaces and the external spaces with visual links to the Titan Crane helping to orientate the user in the wider site. The material choices; material palette is suitably limited and meets practical demands of the waterfront location. Landscaping proposals; the project fosters a positive approach to the effects that art strategies in buildings and their landscapes can have on health and wellbeing. The NHS is investing in well designed and well considered landscaped spaces to promote this link.

It was noted that the project had been the subject of a lengthy and detailed process, working closely with Planning and Building Standards team to develop a proposal that met with the expectation of the building being the 'jewel in the crown' of the

Queens Quay development.

The project team is also attending the QQ design co-ordination workshops run by the Place and Design officer, relating to the wider site development; the relationships between sites and the coordination of the public realm and landscaping strategies.

The building is seen as much more than just a healthcare building and the quality of the development as a catalyst in influencing the quality of the development that follows on QQ and a symbol of health and well being. West Dunbartonshire believe that on this site, good architecture is not enough – the building has to be 'outstanding'.

On 21st February the development team were asked to present an Elected Member's Briefing in order to give an opportunity to the elected members view the development and to voice concerns/issues, to support or to ask for further detail in relation to aspects that may assist with their decision making process



Questions; Due to the particularly advanced nature of the building design, the questions posed by the elected members and planning officers was used as the basis of the Panel discussions.

1. Brick selection;

- Durability of a light brick in QQ waterfront location. (staining?)
- Buff brick use on other prominent council buildings. (compatibility with bricks used on other prominent projects)

2. Corten Steel use –

- Possible wider use of Corten Steel on building. The lack of connection with the Corten colouring at the ground floor level is lacking at higher levels in the building .

3. Window and side panel colouring.

4. The BMX area;

- designed to avoid anti social behaviour or consideration given to an alternative design

5. Flat roof;

- Concerns over drainage, detailing etc.

6. Air conditioning units;

- visibility from ground level

7. Lantern spaces;

- overheating

8. Prominence of sub station on Titan Boulevard.



Workshop Discussion;

Brick use-

The Panel agreed that the use of the light/buff brick was well considered from a design point of view. The similarity in colour to other public buildings being constructed across West Dunbartonshire such as the new council offices at Church Street and the Clydebank Care Home was not thought to be an issue.

It was also noted by the panel that there are many examples of historically significant, civic, stone-built buildings sitting successfully beside stone tenements or buildings of another use but constructed of the same materials and therefore 'over-use' of the same material was not thought to be problematic.

In relation to possible staining of the brick, it was acknowledged by the panel that this was subject to good, considered detailing. Designing the copes and drips in such a way that they project enough to throw water off and managing the water run off at windows, cills or projections off the building.

The presenter confirmed that this has been considered in the design.

The panel queried the window cleaning strategy which is to use a 'spider' aerial window cleaning system, the full exterior of the building can be reached from strategic points using the kit.

Corten Steel use –

The Panel discussed and complemented the careful use of the corten steel in the building and it was agreed that the use in the landscape and at ground level was enough of a celebration and presence in the development.

The corten represents a look to the historical location of the shipyard's foundry with the use in the landscape a representation of the linear nature of the tracks embedded in the ground and used to transport materials around the shipyards. The connecting line/ribbon of corten in the proposals assists with way-finding into the building by wrapping around the main entrance and onto Titan Boulevard. It was suggested this could be enhanced at the secondary entrance to the north of the building and if there was to be more corten in the design it should be used in the same manner.

The panel thought the artists had incorporated the use of the corten beautifully into the overall design. It was stated that this should be celebrated and the use in the landscape should not watered down.

The proposal for a corten steel labyrinth embedded in the ground relates to the historical used of metal on the site and the proven health benefits of 'walking' the pattern of labyrinth were thought to be poetic a welcome strategy for a Health Care building.



Workshop Discussion cont.;

Window and side panel colouring.

This was discussed in conjunction with the discussion relating to possible introduction of more corten steel on the building.

The Panel felt that suggesting changes to the colour selected for window and side panel would undermine the carefully considered design process. It was thought that application at the higher levels of the building, in a less considered way could lead to the building design dating more rapidly.

The BMX area;

Carefully designed in spaces for BMX and skateboard use was welcomed by the Panel.

Flat roof;

The panel were not concerned over the use of a flat roof and briefly discussed down pipe locations. It was agreed the success of flat roofing systems was down to detailing it correctly. Stair access is provided to the roof space and the pitch of the finished surface is such that it can be walked on by maintenance personnel.

Air conditioning units;

The Planning officer outlined their concern over the long views of the building and how these might be affected with views of Plant rooms on the roof. The presenter explained that the plant rooms are carefully positioned toward the courtyard elevation and are in the rendered model shown at the presentation. It was also agreed that the planning application would show long views and key approaches and the drawings would take in all kit, PV's and plant rooms in order to demonstrate their impact on the overall design. Planning officers are keen to avoid concerns raised on site over the roof mounted plant.

Lantern spaces;

Panellists briefly discussed the design of the lantern spaces and it was suggested that more information in relation to the G-values and the thermal modelling strategy would support that these areas will not over-heat.



Workshop/Discussion Cont.;

Prominence of sub station on Titan Boulevard;

The Place and Design Officer outlined that the concern is over the location of the Substation on such a prominent route. Is it the best use of 'prime' space? It also sits close to the social housing site – Site B and will affect the design of the housing.

The design brief dictates that the H&CC should be capable for future extension, meaning the substation is located remotely from the main building. It's location ties in with connecting to the servicing that will be running down Titan Boulevard.

Some consideration has been given by the design team to locating the sub station deeper into the site, away from Titan Boulevard. The presenter noted that a suitable location would be adjacent to the rear of 'Lucky Break' snooker hall building. The poor condition of this existing building to the north of the carpark would have to be addressed if the sub station was to be located in the vicinity of these buildings.

It appears from both a site layout point of view and a commercial point of view that alternative locations for the substation are difficult to manage at this stage in the design process i.e. the wider site design does not lend itself to an alternative location for the sub-station and the extended run of service ducts and lines coming deeper into the site would have a commercial implication, that would adversely impact on the project.

The sub-station is to be surrounded by brick enclosure with a landscape 'buffer' zone between the enclosure and the boulevard. The presenter clarified that there is a slight chance the substation won't be required, however the Panel offered some suggestions as to a resolution including; Making a feature of it with the incorporation of the sub-station into the wider landscape strategy for the titan boulevard. This will be taken forward at the next Queens Quay co-ordination workshop. Incorporation into either the social housing on site B – or linking it with the H&CC building would make it seem less fragmented.



The Report
Pilot Panel Sitting – 7th March 2018
Clydebank Health and Care Centre



Panel Summary/Consensus;

The presentation was comprehensive and clearly laid out the design intent, the thought process and consideration of wider issues that had allowed the design team to arrive at this developed design.

The project is more developed than the 'ideal' stage that a project would come to the Place and Design Panel and therefore the workshop process was tailored specifically with the aim of adding value in some of the areas of discussion at the Elected Member's Briefing.

Indeed one of the Panellists was local and felt elements such as the pedestrian routes, gallery space in the building and attention to detail in the landscaping was something to celebrate.

The Panel commended the success of the moves to fully integrate the landscaping into the overall building design. To design in alternative uses for landscaped areas and ways to activate spaces at other times of the day. Although it was acknowledged that to alleviate concerns over antisocial behaviour congregation, these spaces would have to be well designed.

The Panel recognised in their review comments that a lengthy design process had been undertaken. The balance of commercial and site specific constraints, meeting the complex brief and demands of such a prestigious site was acknowledged as a process that had been undertaken and carefully considered and managed.

While there were some suggestions as to possible further use of Corten steel in the landscape, it's use at a higher level on the elevations was seen as something that would not be easily retro-designed in to this well developed design without undermining the over all building design.

It was agreed that the questions posed in relation to technical detailing of building elements such as the flat roof and the building projections to avoid staining of the buff brick, the possible over heating of the lantern spaces and the plant rooms on the roof should be dealt with by provision of further technical information to support/demonstrate the consideration that has gone into it.

While the substation posed no concern to the Panel, there is scope to consider if this is the right location and perhaps this can be taken forward at the QQ co-ordination workshops.

Concern was also noted by the presenter that the housing across Titan Boulevard would stand at 7 storeys and possibly overlook the building.

In general the Panel felt this was a positive development on the Queens Quay site and were encouraged at the NHS's approach to deliver a quality scheme. The move to design a building that is more than just a Health Care Building; that the clinical medical activities are supported by a recognition of the benefits to health and well-being of having access to art and well considered, quality landscape and building design, is positive and welcomed.